

DFG Research Group 2448:  
Practicing Evidence – Evidencing Practice

Symposium Villa Vigoni, 23<sup>rd</sup> – 24<sup>th</sup> March 2021

**Critiquing Evidence Criticisms: the condition and challenge of evidence criticisms for democratically constituted knowledge societies**



Scientific Coordination

Prof. Dr. Mariacarla Gadebusch Bondio and Prof. Dr. Karin Zachmann

Evidence is a tremendously important, but at the same time heavily contested resource. In recent times it is clear that evidence is being questioned more and more frequently, and established certainties have lost their persuasiveness. Such a tendency to destabilize evidence may actually endanger societal cohesion, by destructing the basis for agreements.

The phenomenon of evidence criticism has so far largely been investigated in terms of the criticism of science, and as the discrediting of science within the context of political or economic conflicts of interests. Within this field, a strand of research has developed, which has shown how evidence is deliberately corroded by corporate funding of counterevidence. The research projects of our group, however, do not focus only on such strategic deconstruction of certainties. Instead, we are interested in indirect forms of evidence criticism. Via examining various modes of the questioning of evidence and investigating them comparatively we hope to better understand the contingencies of evidence, and how they challenge democratically constituted knowledge societies.

23.03.2021

- 09.00–09.15 **Karin Zachmann and Mariacarla Gadebusch Bondio**  
Introduction
- 09.15–09.45 **Christoph Küffer, Rapperswil / Zurich**  
Alternative Practices of Evidence in Ecology Amidst a Perfect Storm of Environmental Crises
- 09.45–10.15 **Sarah Ehlers and Helmuth Trischler**  
Complicating the Equation. Environmentalism and the debate on hazardous pesticides in the Global South during the 1980s
- MODERATOR: Stefan Esselborn, Munich
- 10.15–10.30 COFFEE BREAK
- 10.30–11.00 **Eva Barlösius, Hannover**  
Three Different Forms of Contestation: Questioning the validity of scientific expertise
- 11.00–11.30 **Stefan Esselborn and Karin Zachmann, Munich**  
Evidence Against the 'Atomic State': The nuclear controversy and the rise of 'Gegenforschung' in West Germany (1970s to 1990s)
- 11.30–11.50 **Discussion**
- MODERATOR: Mallory James, Munich
- 11.50–13.00 LUNCH BREAK
- 13.00–13.30 **Carlo Martini, Milan**  
Vicious Evidence —How pseudoscience fuels evidence criticism and destabilizes science
- 13.30–14.00 **Andreas Wenninger, Kevin Altmann, Sascha Dickel, and Michael Kitzing, Mainz/Munich**  
Alternativity or Incorporation: Institutionalisation of Citizen Science as Evidence Critique?
- MODERATOR: Saana Jukola, Bonn
- 14.00–14.15 COFFEE BREAK
- 14.15–14.45 **Edoardo Maria Pelli and Jutta Roosen, Munich**  
The Relevance of the Moral Foundation Theory to Explore Consumer Interpretation of Contested Nutritional Evidence
- 14.45–15.15 **Susanne Kinnebrock, Helena Bilandzic, and Theresa Stahlhut, Augsburg**  
Stories About Villains, Mad Scientists and Failure? Patterns of evidence criticism in media coverage of genomic research
- 15.15–15.35 **Discussion**
- MODERATOR: Sarah Ehlers, Munich
- 15.35–15.45 BREAK
- 15.45–16.30 **Research Group Meeting — organizational questions**
- MODERATOR: Olga Sparschuh, Munich

24.03.2021

- 09.15–09.45 **Saana Jukola and Mariacarla Gadebusch Bondio, Bonn**  
Caps, Scrubs and Trouble with Evidence – what the debate about surgical wear tells us about guideline development
- 09.45–10.15 **Elena Rocca and Rani Anjum, Oslo**  
Expanding the Meaning of Causal Evidence in Medicine: Challenges, achievements and future perspectives of the CauseHealth approach
- MODERATOR: Sarah Ehlers, Munich
- 10.15–10.30 COFFEE BREAK
- 10.30–11.00 **Elif Özmen and Daniel Füger, Giessen**  
Evidence Between Contingency and Necessity. Some philosophical remarks
- 11.00–11.30 **Martha Kenney, San Francisco / Munich**  
How Many Plots Can the Data Hold? Reconciling stories and evidence in Evolutionary Biology
- 11.30–11.50 **Discussion**
- MODERATOR: Olga Sparschuh, Munich
- 11.50–13.00 LUNCH BREAK
- 13.00–13.30 **Ruth Müller and Mallory James, Munich**  
Time as a Judgement Device. How time matters when reviewers generate evidence for ERC starting and consolidator grants.
- 13.30–14.00 **Olga Sparschuh, Munich**  
Evidence of Competence: Professional qualifications of migrants as a contested resource
- MODERATOR: Stefan Esselborn, Munich
- 14.00–14.15 COFFEE BREAK
- 14.15–15.15 **Evidence Criticism Reconsidered – What have we learnt?**
- MODERATORS: Mariacarla Gadebusch Bondio, Bonn  
and Karin Zachmann, Munich
- 15.15–16.00 **Virtual Conference Coffee**